Outcomes – What is Quality Spiritual Care in Health Care and How Do You Measure It? (Revision 2, 7 January 2021)



What is Quality Spiritual Care in Health Care and How Do You Measure It?

Purpose- This statement provides guidance to advocacy groups, professional health care associations, health care administrators, clinical teams, clients, family caregivers, researchers, government and other funders, faith communities, spiritual care professionals and other stakeholders internationally on the indicators of quality and experience of spiritual care in health care, the metrics that indicate quality care is present, and evidence-based tools that can measure and report that quality.

Reason for Action- The value of any health care service is increasingly determined and reimbursed by the quality of the health outcomes that are achieved relative to the costs of care rather than by the volume of services that are produced¹. The COVID pandemic raised awareness of systemic racism and exposed the racial inequities in health care. The pandemic also highlighted the need for high quality spiritual care.^{2,3} Providing culturally responsive care includes assessment of spiritual needs which are often of great importance in diverse communities. Determining and improving the quality of care requires an acknowledged and robust set of quality indicators, the metrics which can identify and delineate quality, and tools which reliably measure those indicators While there is a fastgrowing body of literature supporting quality spiritual care and wide-spread consensus that spiritual care is desired by patients and family caregivers, there is a paucity of valid and reliable measures for determining the quality of spiritual care with the exception of the Quality of Spiritual Care (QSC) scale⁴. The use of Patient Reported Outcome Measures in spiritual care is also increasing in prevalence and scope⁵ and can serve to humanize and balance out validated and well-recognized health and health services indices such as symptom severity and cure rates. The growing interest in spiritual care demands ways of capturing, aggregating, and exchanging data across a variety of care sites, using electronic health records and health information technology.

There is a continuing need to address these gaps by developing and updating indicators that demonstrate the impact of spiritual care on health and health outcomes. In response, this panel of international, multidisciplinary experts reviewed measures, instruments, and tools that have been either guideline-based, or have been empirically developed and tested. The statement seeks to provide guidance to providers of spiritual care, and those who advocate for that care, on the indicators of quality spiritual care, the metrics which measure those indicators and suggested tools which can reliably quantify those indicators. We see this document as a step in a continuing process of defining and promoting quality indicators in spiritual care.

Recommendations

Quality Indicator	Metric	Suggested Tools
1. Structural Indicators		
1.A - Certified or credentialed spiritual care professional(s) are provided proportionate to the size and complexity of the unit served and officially recognized as integrated/embedded members of the clinical staff. ^{6,7,8,9}	Institutional policy recognizes chaplains as official members of the clinical team.	Policy Review
1.B – Dedicated inclusive sacred space is available for meditation, reflection and ritual. ^{10,11}	Yes/No	
1.C - Information is provided about the availability of spiritual care services. ¹²	Percentage of clients and family members surveyed who report they were informed that spiritual care was available	Client Satisfaction Survey
1.D - Professional education and development programs in spiritual care are provided for all clinical disciplines to improve their provision of generalist spiritual care. ^{13,14}	Percentage of clinical staff who report receiving spiritual care training appropriate to their scope of practice.	Lists of programs, number of attendees and feedback forms.
1.E - Spiritual care quality measures are reported regularly as part of the organization's overall quality program and are used to improve practice. ^{15,16} .	List of spiritual care quality measures reported in quality improvement dashboards.	Audit of organizational quality data and improvement initiatives.
2. Process Indicators		
2.A - Specialist spiritual care is made available in a timely manner. ⁶	Percentage of staff who made referrals to spiritual care and report a timely response.	Survey of staff. Chaplaincy data reports

Quality Indicator	Metric	Suggested Tools
	Percentage of referrals responded to within Chaplaincy Service guidelines.	
2.B - All clients are offered the opportunity to have a discussion of religious/spiritual concerns ^{17,18}	Percentage of clients surveyed who say they were offered a discussion of religious/spiritual concerns	Client Survey
2.C - An assessment of religious, spiritual, and existential concerns using a structured instrument is conducted and documented, and the information obtained from the assessment is integrated into the overall care plan. ^{4,6}	Percentage of clients assessed using established tools such as FICA, ¹⁹ Hope ²⁰ ,7X7 ²¹ , PC-7 ²² , AIM ²³ or Outcome Oriented ²⁴ models with a spiritual care plan as part of the overall plan of care.	Chart Review
2.D - Spiritual, religious, and cultural practices are facilitated for clients, the people important to them and staff ⁴	Number of referrals for spiritual practices. Spiritual care practices documented in clients' records Usage of sacred space.	Referral Logs including disposition of referrals and client satisfaction surveys. Chart audit
2.E - Families are offered the opportunity to discuss spiritual issues during goals of care conferences ^{25,26}	Percentage of care conference reports in which it is noted that families are given the opportunity to discuss spiritual issues or referrals are made to spiritual care.	Chart Audit
2.F. Spiritual care is provided in a culturally and linguistically appropriate manner (e.g. client's language and literacy level). ⁴ Clients' values and beliefs are integrated into plans of care. 27,28	Percentage of clients surveyed who say that they were provided care in a culturally and linguistically appropriate manner. Percentage of documented plans of care that mention client beliefs and values.	Client Survey. Chart audit

Quality Indicator	Metric	Suggested Tools
2.G . End of life and	Percentage of care plans for	Chart Audit.
Bereavement Care is timely	clients approaching end of life	
and provided as appropriate	that include attention to end of	
to the population served.	life care and a plan for	
29,4,30	bereavement care after death.	
2. H. Spiritual care is offered	Number of requests for spiritual	Referrals and
to all staff formally (e.g.	care received and attendance at	activity logs.
groups and scheduled	events open to staff such as	
meetings) and informally	worship, meditation, memorial	
(e.g. unscheduled	services, support groups, and	
encounters). ^{31,32,33}	debriefings.	
3. Outcomes		
3. Outcomes		
3.A Client spiritual needs are met. ³⁴	Percentage of clients surveyed reporting that spiritual needs	Spiritual NeedsAssessment
	were met.	Inventory for
		Patients (SNAP) ³⁵
		Spiritual Needs
		Questionnaire
		(SpNQ) ³⁶
3.B - Spiritual care positively	Client satisfaction is higher for	➤ HCAHPS #21 ³⁹
impacts client	those who receive spiritual care.	> QSC ²
satisfaction ^{37,38}		, 400
3.C – Spiritual care reduces	Percentage of clients reporting	"Are you
client spiritual distress ^{22,40,41}	reduced spiritual distress after	experiencing
	spiritual care.	spiritual pain right
		now?" ^{42,43}
		Client Survey
3.D – Spiritual care	Percentage of clients surveyed	➤ Facit-SP-Peace
positively impacts clients'	reporting increased sense of	Subscale ⁴⁵
sense of peace. ⁴⁴	peace after spiritual care.	> "Are you at
.		Peace?"46
		➤ Client Survey
		➤ PROMs??
		>
3.E – Spiritual care positively	Percentage of clients surveyed	Facit-SP- Meaning
impacts meaning-making for	reporting increased ability to find	subscale
clients and family members.	measure of meaning after	➤ RCOPE ⁴⁹
47,48	spiritual care.	Client Survey

Quality Indicator	Metric	Suggested Tools
3.F – Spiritual care positively	Percentage of clients surveyed	Facit-SP
impacts spiritual well-being	reporting increased spiritual	
and overall quality of life. ^{50,51,}	well-being after spiritual care.	
32		

¹ Porter ME. What is value in health care? *N Engl J Med.* 2010;363(26):2477-2481.

² Ferrell, B, Handzo, G, Picchi, T, Puchalski, C, & Rosa, W. (2020) The Urgency of Spiritual Care: COVID-19 and the Critical Need for Whole-Person Palliation. *Journal of Pain & Symptom Management.* 60-(3), e7-e11.

³ Egede LE, Walker RJ. <u>Structural Racism, Social Risk Factors, and Covid-19 - A Dangerous Convergence for Black Americans.</u> N Engl J Med. 2020 Sep 17;383(12):e77. doi: 10.1056/NEJMp2023616. Epub 2020 Jul 22

⁴ Daaleman T., Reed D., Cohen, L., Zimmerman, S. (2014) Development and Preliminary Testing of the Quality of Spiritual Care Scale. J. of Pain & Symptom Management., 47(4), 793-800.

⁵ Snowden, A., & Telfer, I. (2017). Patient reported outcome measure of spiritual care as delivered by chaplains. *Journal of Health Care Chaplaincy*, *23*(4), 131-155.

⁶ Handzo, G. F. & Koenig, H. G. (2004). Spiritual Care: Whose Job is it Anyway? *Southern Medical Journal*, *97*(12), 1242-1244.

⁷ Wintz SK., Handzo GF. 2005. Pastoral Care Staffing & Productivity: More than Ratios. *Chaplaincy Today.* 21(1), 3-10.

⁸ LaRocca-Pitts, M. (2019) The Board Certified Chaplain as a Member of the Transdisciplinary Team: An epistemological approach to spiritual care. *Journal of the Study of Spirituality*. 9(2), 99-109.

⁹ Cunningham, C. J., Panda, M., Lambert, J., Daniel, G., & DeMars, K. (2017). Perceptions of chaplains' value and impact within hospital care teams. *Journal of religion and health*, *56*(4), 1231-1247.

¹⁰ The National Consensus Project for Quality Palliative Care *Clinical Practice Guidelines for Quality Palliative Care 4th edition 2018.*

¹¹ Baldacchino, D. (2017). Spirituality in the healthcare workplace. *Religions*, 8(12), 260.

- ¹² National Quality Forum. (2006) A National Framework and Preferred Practiced for Palliative and Hospice Care Quality. National Quality Forum, Washington, DC.
- ¹³ Puchalski C, Ferrell B, Virani R, Otis-Green S, Baird P, Bull J, Chochinov H, Handzo G, Nelson-Becker H, Prince-Paul M, Pugliese K, Sulmasy D. (2009). <u>Improving the quality of spiritual care as a dimension of palliative care: the report of the Consensus Conference</u>. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*. 12(10):885-904.
- ¹⁴ Austin, P., Macleod, R., Siddall, P., McSherry, W., & Egan, R. (2017). Spiritual care training is needed for clinical and non-clinical staff to manage patients' spiritual needs. *Journal for the Study of Spirituality*, 7(1), 50-63.
- ¹⁵ Arthur J. (2011) Lean Six Sigma- Simple Steps to Fast, Affordable, Flawless Healthcare. New York: McGraw Hill.
- ¹⁶ Cone, P. H., & Giske, T. (2018). Integrating spiritual care into nursing education and practice: Strategies utilizing Open Journey Theory. *Nurse Educ Today, 71*, 22-25. doi:10.1016/j.nedt.2018.08.015
- ¹⁷ Williams JA, Meltzer D, Arora V, Chung G, & Curlin FA (2011). Attention to Inpatients' Religious and Spiritual Concerns: Predictors and Association with Patient Satisfaction. *Journal of general internal medicine* PMID: <u>21720904</u>
- ¹⁸ Lee, A. C., McGinness, C. E., Levine, S., O'Mahony, S., & Fitchett, G. (2018). Using Chaplains to Facilitate Advance Care Planning in Medical Practice. *JAMA Intern Med, 178*(5), 708-710. doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2017.7961
- ¹⁹ Puchalski, C., & Romer, A. L. (2000). Taking a spiritual history allows clinicians to understand patients more fully. *Journal of palliative Medicine*, *3*(1), 129-137.
- ²⁰ Anandarajah, G., & Hight, E. (2001). Spirituality and medical practice. *American family physician*, *63*(1), 81-88.
- ²¹ Fitchett, G. (1993). *Assessing spiritual needs: A guide for caregivers*. Augsburg Fortress.
- ²² Fitchett, G., Pierson, A. L. H., Hoffmeyer, C., Labuschagne, D., Lee, A., Levine, S., ... & Waite, N. (2019). Development of the PC-7, a Quantifiable Assessment of Spiritual Concerns of Patients Receiving Palliative Care Near the End of Life. *Journal of palliative medicine*.
- ²³ Kestenbaum, A., Shields, M., James, J., Hocker, W., Morgan, S., Karve, S., ... & Dunn, L. B. (2017). What impact do chaplains have? A pilot study of spiritual AIM for advanced cancer patients in outpatient palliative care. *Journal of pain and symptom management*, *54*(5), 707-714.

- ²⁴ VandeCreek, L., Lucas, A. M. (2001). *The Discipline for Pastoral Care Giving: Foundations for Outcome Oriented Chaplaincy*. Haworth Press: New York.
- ²⁵ Ernecoff, N, Curlin, F., Buddadhumaruk,P, White, D. Health Care Professionals' Responses to Religious or Spiritual Statements by Surrogate Decision Makers During Goals-of-Care Discussions *JAMA Intern Med.* 2015;175(10):1662-1669. doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2015.4124
- ²⁶ Maiko, S. M., Ivy, S., Watson, B. N., Montz, K., & Torke, A. M. (2018). Spiritual and Religious Coping of Medical Decision Makers for Hospitalized Older Adult Patients. *J Palliat Med*. doi:10.1089/jpm.2018.0406
- ²⁷ Joint Commission Resources. (2010) Advancing Effective Communication, Cultural Competence, and Patient-and Family-Centered Care: A Roadmap for Hospitals http://www.jointcommission.org/assets/1/6/ARoadmapforHospitalsfinalversion727.pdf
- ²⁸ Bashar, F. R., Vahedian-Azimi, A., Salesi, M., Hajiesmaeili, M., Shojaei, S., Farzanegan, B., Collaborative, M. (2018). Spiritual Health and Outcomes in Muslim ICU Patients: A Nationwide Cross Sectional Study. *J Relig Health*, *57*(6), 2241-2257. doi:10.1007/s10943-017-0543-5
- ²⁹ Balboni, T. A., Paulk, M. E., Balboni, M. J., Phelps, A. C., Loggers, E. T., Wright, A. A., ... & Prigerson, H. G. (2010). Provision of spiritual care to patients with advanced cancer: associations with medical care and quality of life near death. *Journal of Clinical Oncology*, *28*(3), 445-452.
- ³⁰ Donnelly, S., Prizeman, G., Coimín, D. Ó., Korn, B., & Hynes, G. (2018). Voices that matter: end-of-life care in two acute hospitals from the perspective of bereaved relatives. *BMC palliative care*, *17*(1), 117.
- ³¹ McClelland L, & Vogus, T. (2013) Compassion Practices and HCAHPS: Does Rewarding and Supporting Workplace Compassion Influence Patient Perceptions? Health Services Research. 1670-1683.
- ³² Doolittle, B. R., & Windish, D. M. (2015). Correlation of burnout syndrome with specific coping strategies, behaviors, and spiritual attitudes among interns at Yale University, New Haven, USA. Journal of Educational Evaluation for Health Professions, 12.
- ³³ Keogh, M., Marin, D. B., Jandorf, L., Wetmore, J. B., & Sharma, V. (2020). Chi Time: Expanding a novel approach for hospital employee engagement. The Journal of Excellence in Nursing Leadership, 51(4), 32-38.
- ³⁴Balboni, et al. (2007). Religiousness and Spiritual Support Among Advanced Cancer Patients and Associations with End-of-Life Treatment Preferences and Quality of Life. *Journal of Clinical Oncology*, *25*(*5*), 555-560

- ³⁵ Sharma, R. K., Astrow, A. B., Texeira, K. and Sulmasy, D. P.(2012) "The Spiritual Needs Assessment for Patients (SNAP): development and validation of a comprehensive instrument to assess unmet spiritual needs." Journal of Pain & Symptom Management 44, no. 1: 44-51.
- ³⁶ Büssing A(1), Balzat HJ, Heusser P. (2010) Spiritual needs of patients with chronic pain diseases and cancer validation of the spiritual needs questionnaire. Eur J Med Res. Jun 28;15(6):266-73
- ³⁷ Marin DB, Sharma V, Sosunov E, Egorova N, Goldstein R, Handzo G. 2015. The relationship between chaplain visits and patient satisfaction. Journal of Health Care Chaplaincy. 21 (1):14-24.
- ³⁸ Astrow, A. B., Kwok, G., Sharma, R. K., Fromer, N., & Sulmasy, D. P. (2018). Spiritual Needs and Perception of Quality of Care and Satisfaction With Care in Hematology/Medical Oncology Patients: A Multicultural Assessment. *J Pain Symptom Manage*, *55*(1), 56-64 e51. doi:10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2017.08.009
- ³⁹ Giordano, L. A., Elliott, M. N., Goldstein, E., Lehrman, W. G., & Spencer, P. A. (2009). Development, implementation, and public reporting of the HCAHPS survey. *Medical Care Research and Review*.
- ⁴⁰ Schultz, M., Meged-Book, T., Mashiach, T., & Bar-Sela, G. (2017). Distinguishing between spiritual distress, general distress, spiritual well-being, and spiritual pain among cancer patients during oncology treatment. *Journal of pain and symptom management*, *54*(1), 66-73.
- ⁴¹ Steinhauser, K. E., Olsen, A., Johnson, K. S., Sanders, L. L., Olsen, M., Ammarell, N., & Grossoehme, D. (2016). The feasibility and acceptability of a chaplain-led intervention for caregivers of seriously ill patients: A Caregiver Outlook pilot study. *Palliative & supportive care*, *14*(5), 456.
- ⁴² Mako C, Galek M, Poppito SR. (2006) Spiritual pain among patients with advanced cancer in palliative care. J Palliat Med. 9(5):1106-1113.
- ⁴³ Exline JJ, Pargament KI, Grubbs JB, et al. The Religious and Spiritual Struggles Scale: development and initial validation. Psychol Relig Spiritual 2014;6:208–222
- ⁴⁴ Snowdon A., Telfer I, Kelly E, Bunniss S, Mowat H. (2013) "I was able to talk about what was on my mind." The operationalisation of person centred care. *The Scottish J of Health Care Chaplaincy*. 16 (Special), 16-22.
- ⁴⁵ Peterman, A. H., Fitchett, G., Brady, M. J., Hernandez, L., & Cella, D. (2002). Measuring spiritual well-being in people with cancer: The Functional Assessment of Chronic Illness

Therapy - Spiritual Well-Being Scale (FACIT-Sp). Annals of Behavioral Medicine, 24(1), 49-58.

- ⁴⁶ Steinhauser KE, Voils CI, Clipp EC, Bosworth HB, Christakis NA, Tulsky JA.(2006) "Are you at peace?": one item to probe spiritual concerns at the end of life. Archives of Internal Medicine. Jan 9;166(1):101-5.
- ⁴⁷ Flannelly, K. J., Handzo, G. F., Weaver, A. J., & Smith, W. J. (2005b). A national survey of health care administrators' views on the importance of various chaplain roles. Journal of Pastoral Care & Counseling, 59(1-2), 87 96.
- ⁴⁸ Robert, R., Stavinoha, P., Jones, B. L., Robinson, J., Larson, K., Hicklen, R., ... & Weaver, M. S. (2019). Spiritual assessment and spiritual care offerings as a standard of care in pediatric oncology: A recommendation informed by a systematic review of the literature. *Pediatric blood & cancer*, e27764.
- ⁴⁹ Pargament, K. I., Koenig, H. G., & Perez, L. M. (2000). The many methods of religious coping: Development and initial validation of the RCOPE. *Journal of clinical psychology*, *56*(4), 519-543.
- ⁵⁰ Rabow M, Knish S. (2014) Spiritual well-being among outpatients with cancer receiving concurrent oncologic and palliative care. *Support Care Cancer*. DOI 10.1007/s00520-014-2428-4
- ⁵¹ Bai, M., & Lazenby, M. (2015). A systematic review of associations between spiritual wellbeing and quality of life at the scale and factor levels in studies among patients with cancer. *Journal of palliative medicine*, *18*(3), 286-298.

The list of quality indicators was originally developed in 2016 by a distinguished, international panel of experts convened by the HealthCare Chaplaincy Network. References were updated in 2019 and the full document was updated and reviewed by the panel below in 2021.

Timothy Daaleman, DO, **MPH,** professor of family medicine, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, N.C.

Betty Ferrell, Ph.D., M.A., F.A.A.N., F.P.C.N., director and professor, Division of Nursing Research and Education, Department of Population Sciences, City of Hope Comprehensive Cancer Center, Duarte, CA.

Charles W. Fluharty, Ph.D. Founder and president emeritus, Rural Policy Research Institute, Iowa City, Iowa

Rev. Eric J. Hall, M. Div., MA, president and CEO, HealthCare Chaplaincy Network, New York, NY

The Rev. George Handzo, **BCC**, **CSSBB**, director of health services research and quality, HealthCare Chaplaincy Network, New York, NY

Cheryl Holmes, OAM, CEO, Spiritual Health Association, Melbourne, Australia

Diane Meier, M.D., FACP, director, Center to Advance Palliative Care (CAPC), New York, NY

R. Sean Morrison, M.D., director, Lilian and Benjamin Hertzberg Palliative Care Institute and the National Palliative Care Research Center at Mount Sinai, New York

Shane Sinclair, Ph.D., associate professor, Cancer Care Research Professorship, Director, Compassion Research Lab., Faculty of Nursing, University of Calgary, Alberta, Canada

Rev. Sue Wintz, **M.Div., BCC**, director of professional and community education, HealthCare Chaplaincy Network, New York